

Minutes of a meeting of the WEST AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE on Tuesday 10 April 2018

www.oxford.gov.uk



Committee members:

Councillor Upton (Chair)	Councillor Cook (Vice-Chair)
Councillor Azad	Councillor Fooks
Councillor Hollingsworth	Councillor Iley-Williamson
Councillor Price	Councillor Wade

Officers:

Adrian Arnold, Development Management Service Manager
Robert Fowler, Planning Team Leader
Gill Butter, Conservation and Urban Design Officer
Tobias Fett, Planning Officer
Sally Fleming, Lawyer
Catherine Phythian, Committee Services Officer

Apologies:

Councillor Lygo sent apologies.

85. Declarations of interest

17/03330/FUL and 17/03332/FUL

Councillor Cook, as a Council appointed trustee for Oxford Preservation Trust stated that he had taken no part in any discussions or decision making by those organisations that may have taken place regarding these applications.

Councillor Upton, as a Council appointed trustee for Oxford Preservation Trust stated that she had taken no part in any discussions or decision making by those organisations that may have taken place regarding these applications.

17/02229/FUL

Councillor Upton, as a signature to the call-in of the application stated that she retained an open mind about the proposal.

86. 17/03330/FUL: 2 Savile Road, Oxford, OX1 3UA (New College)

The Committee considered an application (17/03330/FUL) for planning permission for the proposed demolition of Warham House, New College School hall and partial demolition of Savile House rear extension; the erection of three new buildings and reconstruction of Savile House rear extension to provide C2 residential college including Music Hall, assembly, academic and study space, Porter's Lodge and associated accommodation, and replacement D1 facilities for New College School including dining hall, assembly space and class rooms.

The Planning Officer presented the report and made the following updates:

- Sport England had raised no objection
- Additional conditions relating to archaeology would need to be included if the application were to be approved

Debbie Dance (Oxford Preservation Trust) and Allan Dodd (Mansfield College) spoke against the application.

David Palfreyman (New College), David Kohn (David Kohn architects), Chris Pattison (Turnberry Planning) spoke in favour of the application.

The Committee asked questions of the officers and public speakers about the details of the application. In discussion they welcomed the overall scheme for its innovative architectural approach but expressed concerns about the proposed tower.

It was suggested that the application should be deferred to allow planning officers and the applicant to explore possible amendments to the application plans which would address the concerns about the tower. This was formally proposed, seconded and on being put to the vote, agreed by a majority of the Committee.

The West Area Planning Committee resolved to defer this application (17/03330/FUL) to a future meeting to allow planning officers and the applicant to explore possible amendments to the application plans which would address the concerns about the tower.

Councillor Iley-Williamson arrived during this item and consequently took no part in its determination.

87. 17/03332/FUL: New College Sports Ground, St Cross Road

The West Area Planning Committee resolved to defer this application to a future meeting as it is linked to the major development under 17/03330/FUL.

88. 17/03040/FUL: 53 Sunderland Avenue, Oxford, OX2 8DT

The Committee considered an application (17/03040/FUL) for planning permission for the demolition of existing dwelling house, parking and garage; the erection of a replacement building comprising 6 flats (2x3 bedrooms, 2x2 bedrooms and 2x1 bedroom), car parking and landscaping.

The Planning Officer presented the report.

The Committee discussion concentrated on the viability of the scheme and the details of the proposed s106 agreement to secure a financial contribution for off-site affordable housing from any potential uplift from the currently assumed sales values. The Committee noted that the proposed arrangements for the s106 agreement would be subject to a robust methodology and that this approach had been used by other local authorities. The planning officers confirmed that the trigger for any potential uplift would

be based on the profit margin and that this would be independently assessed when the development was substantially complete (i.e. at the point at which the units could be marketed for sale or rent).

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it.

On being put to the vote a majority of the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

a) approve the application (17/03040/FUL) for the reasons given in the report and subject to the 14 required planning conditions set out in section 12 of the officer's report and grant planning permission subject to:

The satisfactory completion of a legal agreement under s.106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and other enabling powers to secure the planning obligations set out in the recommended heads of terms which were set out in the report; and

b) agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:

1. Finalise the recommended conditions as set out in the report including such refinements, amendments, additions and/or deletions as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary;
2. Finalise the recommended legal agreement under section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and other enabling powers as set out in this report, including refining, adding to, amending and/or deleting the obligations detailed in the heads of terms set out in this report (including to dovetail with and where appropriate, reinforce the final conditions and informatives to be attached to the planning permission) as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary; and
3. Complete the section 106 legal agreement referred to above and issue the planning permission.

89. 17/02229/FUL: 12 Crick Road, Oxford, OX2 6QL

The Committee considered an application (17/02229/FUL) for planning permission for the part demolition and reconstruction of the western part of the house with alterations to the front elevation, the front eaves and the west facing gable, including revised fenestration, replacement of the secondary doorway with a window: with formation of a new access and lightwell to an extended and deepened basement level, with single, two and three storey extensions above to the rear; reconstruction of the single storey side extension with an increased height; landscaping and changes to the front boundary including installation of wall, gates and railings; bin and Cycle stores.

The application had been called in by Cllrs Upton, Pressel, Fry and Clarkson because of concerns over the effect on the special character and setting of the North Oxford Victorian Suburb Conservation Area.

The Planning Officer presented the report and referred the Committee to an error in the report on pages 108 and 109: references to 10 Crick Road should refer to 13 Crick Road.

The Planning Officer informed the Committee that Historic England had considered an application to make 12 Crick Road a listed building; this had been refused on the basis that the building does not warrant listing as despite designed by an important local architect it was not the best example of his work.

Dr Nicholas Davies and Dr David Coleman spoke against the application on behalf of the Norham Manor Residents' Association (NMRA).

Kieran Roberts and Nicholas Worledge spoke in favour of the application.

The Committee asked questions of the officers and public speakers about the details of the application. The Committee discussion included, but was not limited to, the following points:

- concerns about the impact of the proposed development on the character of the North Oxford Victorian Suburb Conservation Area particularly in respect of the views between properties and the degree of overbearing on neighbouring properties
- If the application were to be approved then a further condition should be added to provide for a Level 2 recording of the property (photographic record and summary)
- If the application were to be approved Conditions 9, 10 and 11 should be revised to include trees adjacent to the site and in neighbouring gardens

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it. On balance a majority of the Committee felt that the proposed development would give rise to a harmful impact on the character, appearance and special significance of the North Oxford Victorian Suburb Conservation Area which was not outweighed by any public benefit.

A proposal to approve the application in accordance with the officer recommendation was moved but not seconded.

A proposal to refuse the application was moved and seconded. On being put to the vote, a majority of the Committee resolved to **refuse** planning permission for application (17/02229/FUL).

The West Area Planning Committee resolved to refuse the application (17/02229/FUL) for the following reasons:

1. Design & Heritage

The proposed development would fail to be considered acceptable in design terms by virtue of its reduction of gaps enabling views between the buildings brought about by the scale and massing of the extensions, having had regard to the character of the existing dwelling and its impact on the North Oxford Victorian

Suburb Conservation Area as it would constitute a moderate level of less-than-substantial harm, which would not be outweighed by public benefit. The proposal would therefore represent unacceptable development that would harm the character, appearance and special significance of the conservation area and fail to meet the objectives of policies CP1, CP6, CP8, CP10 and HE7 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016; and Policy CS18 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026; and Policy HP9 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013) and Chapter 12 of the NPPF

2. Neighbour Impact

It is considered that the proposal will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity as it will create an overbearing and incongruous appearance, especially on 13 Crick Road. The proposal therefore does not comply with Policies CP1, CP6, CP8, and CP10 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016; and Policy CS18 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026; and Policies HP9 and HP14 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013).

90. 18/00322/CT3: Oxford City Council Parks Depot, Cutteslowe Park, Harbord Road, Oxford, OX2 8ES

The Committee considered an application (18/00322/CT3) for planning permission for the refurbishment of existing offices to create new kitchen/staff room and disabled WC; the formation of new office in existing storage area; insertion of 1no. window to north elevation, alterations to existing disabled access to west elevation and re-cladding of external walls and installation of external insulation.

The Planning Officer presented the report.

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it.

On being put to the vote a majority of the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

- a) approve the application (18/00322/CT3) for the reasons given in the report and subject to the 3 required planning conditions set out in section 12 of the officer's report and grant planning permission; and**
- b) agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:**
finalise the recommended conditions as set out in the report including such refinements, amendments, additions and/or deletions as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary.

91. Minutes

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 13 March 2018 as a true and accurate record.

92. Forthcoming applications

The Committee noted the list of forthcoming applications.

93. Dates of future meetings

The Committee noted the dates of future meetings.

0. Chair's remarks

The Chair closed the meeting by noting that Councillors Price, Fooks and Wade would be standing down at the forthcoming elections. The Committee thanked them for their commitment and contribution to the work of the West Area Planning Committee. In response the Councillors expressed their gratitude to the planning officers, legal advisers and committee clerks who had supported them as members of the Committee. In particular they commended the planning officers for the quality of the reports.

The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 8.45 pm

Chair

Date: Monday 21 May 2018